Report To Banff & Buchan Area Committee – 21 August 2018

Reference No: APP/2018/1024

Full Planning Permission for Installation of 8 Replacement Double Glazed Windows at Craigowan, 3 Main Street, Inverallochy

Applicant: Mr & Mrs G S Noble
Agent: Job Worth Doing Ltd

Grid Ref: E: 404420 N: 865058
Ward No. and Name: W03 – Fraserburgh & District
Application Type: Full Planning Permission
Representations 0
Consultations 1
Relevant Proposals Map Aberdeenshire Local Development Plan 2017
Designations: Inverallochy Conservation Area; Settlement
Complies with No
Development Plans: Refuse

Main Recommendation Refuse

NOT TO SCALE
Reproduced from Ordnance Survey mapping with the permission of the Controller of Her Majesty’s Stationery Office © Crown copyright and database rights. Ordnance Survey Licence Number 0100020767.
1. **Reason for Report**

1.1 The Committee is able to consider and take a decision on this item in terms of Section B.9.1 of Part 2A List of Committee Powers and Section C.3.1i of Part 2C Planning Delegations of the Scheme of Governance as the application is recommended for refusal but at least two Local Ward Members in the Ward in which the development is proposed, have requested that the application be referred to the Area Committee.

- Councillor Andrew Kille: “To discuss the meaning of ‘character and appearance’ within policy HE2”
- Councillor Charles Buchan: “To discuss further the reasons for refusal”
- Councillor Doreen Mair: “To further investigate the reasons for refusal”

1.2 The Head of Finance and Monitoring Officer within Business Services have been consulted in the preparation of this report and had no comments to make and are satisfied that the report complies with the Scheme of Governance and relevant legislation.

2. **Background and Proposal**

2.1 Full Planning Permission is sought for installation of 8 replacement double glazed windows at Craigowan, 3 Main Street, Inverallochy. Location and site plans are attached as Appendices 1 & 2.

2.2 The proposed development is situated within the Inverallochy Conservation Area. The property is a non-listed traditional stone built 1½- storey dwelling with a long dormer extension on the southeast, 1½- storey extension to the northeast with a dormer on the northwest, and 1½- storey gabled extension attached by a lean to on the southeast. The property is on an “L” footprint, with a small walled garden to the southeast and an opening to its rear (northwest). The main house has a 3-bay frontage with two bay windows flanking the main entrance door at the centre. A plan illustrating the current elevations and window detail is attached as Appendix 3.

2.3 The proposal is to replace 8 timber windows of the property with uPVC windows in rosewood, including six bay windows, one on the southwest gable next to Main Street, and one at the ground floor on the northeast extension. Details illustrating the revisions to the property as a result of the proposals are contained in Appendix 4.

2.4 There are 14 windows and 2 rooflights on the property, six of which have already been replaced with uPVC double glazed windows under the previous planning approvals (APP/2017/0179 with amendment APP/2017/0930, and APP/2017/2108). It was considered that the six replacement windows would not change the overall appearance of the residential property and would have neutral impact on the Conservation Area, although it would be desirable to
reinstall timber windows or for the new windows to replicate the fenestration of a traditional unit.

2.5 Relevant Planning History

APP/2017/0179
Full Planning Permission for Replacement of 4 Windows at Craigowan, 3 Main Street, Inverallochy, granted 21.03.2017 [4 windows on box dormer southeast elevation]

APP/2017/0930
Full Planning Permission for Installation of 3 Replacement Windows at Craigowan, 3 Main Street, Inverallochy, granted 05.06.2017 [amended design to APP/2017/0179, but just 3 windows on box dormer southeast elevation, main house]

APP/2017/2108
Full Planning Permission for Installation of 2 Replacement Windows at Craigowan, 3 Main Street, Inverallochy, granted 08.12.2017 [rear (i.e. northwest) elevation, dormer window and ground floor single window]

N970019HA Erection of Garage at 3 Main Street, Inverallochy, Approved

3. Representations

3.1 No valid letters of representation have been received.

4. Consultations

4.1 Infrastructure Services (Environment—Built Heritage) state that a recent inspection of the property identified that the building has a mix of timber and uPVC windows of ‘modern’ fenestration which all appear to be in a good state of repair. The current proposal would result in the loss of a traditional detailing and be at odds with the general principle of conservation area status which is to ‘preserve or enhance’. Replacement windows should be on a like for like basis or ensure that they’re true sash & case units in the vertical proportioned openings such as those manufactured by ‘Masterframe’ or an equivalent model, if uPVC is conceded.

5. Relevant Planning Policies

5.1 Scottish Planning Policy

The aim of the Scottish Planning Policies is to ensure that development and changes in land use occur in suitable locations and are sustainable. The planning system must also provide protection from inappropriate development. Its primary objectives are:

- to set the land use framework for promoting sustainable economic development;
- to encourage and support regeneration; and
- to maintain and enhance the quality of the natural heritage and built environment.

Development and conservation are not mutually exclusive objectives; the aim is to resolve conflicts between the objectives set out above and to manage change. Planning policies and decisions should not prevent or inhibit development unless there are sound reasons for doing so. The planning system guides the future development and use of land in cities, towns and rural areas in the long term public interest. The goal is a prosperous and socially just Scotland with a strong economy, homes, jobs and a good living environment for everyone.

5.2 Aberdeen City and Shire Strategic Development Plan 2014

The purpose of this Plan is to set a clear direction for the future development of the North East. It promotes a spatial strategy. All parts of the Strategic Development Plan area will fall within either a strategic growth area or a local growth and diversification area. Some areas are also identified as regeneration priority areas. There are also general objectives identified. In summary, these cover promoting economic growth; promoting sustainable economic development which will reduce carbon dioxide production, adapt to the effects of climate change and limit the amount of non-renewable resources used; encouraging population growth; maintaining and improving the region’s built, natural and cultural assets; promoting sustainable communities; and improving accessibility in developments.

5.3 Aberdeenshire Local Development Plan 2017

Policy P1: Layout, Siting and Design
Policy HE2: Protecting Historic and Cultural Areas

5.4 Other Material Considerations

APP/2017/0179
APP/2017/0930
APP/2017/2108

Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016, Scottish Planning Policy, and Historic Scotland’s Managing Change in the Historic Environment guidance note series

6. Discussion

6.1 The main issues to be considered in the application are the design and the impact of the proposal on the character and the appearance of the Inverallochy Conservation Area.
Impact on Built Heritage

6.2 Policy HE2 does not allow development, including change of use or demolition, which would not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of a conservation area. The design, scale, layout, siting and materials used in development within a Conservation Area must be of the highest quality and respect the individual characteristics for which the Conservation Area was designated.

6.3 The existing dwelling with extensions is a non-listed building situated within the Inverallochy Conservation Area. It is evident that the dwelling is a stone built traditional house with slate roof. The windows of the dwelling would be of timber sash and case type originally, with a vertical emphasis. The windows on later extensions (including the dormers) clearly have a horizontal emphasis which are out of keeping with the rest of the fenestration of the property. The bay windows on the southeast elevation appear to be later additions too. However, the form and pattern of the bay windows have retained or replicate some character of the original windows which can be traced from two single windows on the southwest gable and the rear (northwest) elevation respectively.

6.4 The eight windows (including 6 on bay windows) to be replaced currently are of timber and are in reasonable condition. No condition survey for the existing timber windows has been submitted to demonstrate that the existing windows are so beyond economic repair that replacement is the only option.

6.5 Under the policies, any new proposal to replace the existing windows within a Conservation Area should seek to match the original units as closely as possible in terms of design, construction and material finish. The use of uPVC windows would erode the traditional appearance of the building and result in the loss of original architectural elements.

6.6 The Planning Service notes that 6 windows have already been replaced with uPVC windows in the past under the previous planning approvals. It is also acknowledged that those windows are non-traditional in terms of design and material, and that their positions are mainly on the equally non-traditional box dormer extensions. Although it would be desirable to incorporate a number of minor modifications to the proposed installations, it was considered that the impact of the proposed uPVC windows on the existing unsympathetic box dormers and the whole property would be neutral, therefore would ‘preserve’ the character of the building and the settlement. Accordingly, the proposals were considered to be acceptable.

6.7 The Planning Service also notes that a neighbouring building at 4 Mid Street was granted permission for replacement uPVC windows (APP/2014/2016) in the past. Having reviewed that case, it is clear that the situation of that proposal, which was to replace existing uPVC windows with almost identical uPVC windows, is similar to that of the previous proposals for this property at 3 Main Street. The stance of the Planning Service on similar situations is therefore consistent.
6.8 The current proposal mainly consists of uPVC replacement of the existing timber bay windows on the main house, which still retain some traditional characteristics, and a single timber window (no. 7) with vertical emphasis on the southwest gable, which is located immediately to Main Street.

6.9 The Planning Service is of the view that if replacement were inevitable, the most desirable option would be the use of single or double glazed timber sash and case windows so as to conserve the original character and appearance of the building. Continuing the replacing of windows of traditional character with uPVC would lead to further loss of the original architectural elements of the building. In a wider context, the use of non-traditional materials such as uPVC would cause further erosion of the character and appearance of Inverallochy Conservation Area, which has already suffered from a number of undesirable developments, including those that were completed under permitted development rights in the past. This is an opportunity to reinstate fenestration of original character to the property by adopting traditional design, construction, and materials. Particularly, the locations of the currently proposed replacement windows being more prominent would mean that any adverse impact on the character of the Conservation Area would be more direct compared to that of the previous proposals.

**Conclusion**

6.10 In conclusion, the Planning Service considers that the development fails to comply with relevant policies of the Aberdeenshire Local Development Plan, in that the proposed uPVC replacement windows would result in further loss of the original architectural character of the building, which would be detrimental to the wider character and appearance of Inverallochy Conservation Area and undermine the principles of the original designation. Material considerations such as past approvals have been taken into account. However, the assessment of the current proposal is not considered to be inconsistent with those in the past. Therefore, no material considerations would warrant granting planning permission of this proposal.

6.11 Accordingly, the application for replacement uPVC windows is recommended for refusal by the Planning Service.

7. **Area Implications**

7.1 In the specific circumstances of this application there is no direct connection with the currently specified objectives and identified actions of the Local Community Plan.

8. **Implications and Risk**

8.1 An equality impact assessment is not required because the proposal does not have a differential impact on any of the protected characteristics.

8.2 There are no staffing and financial implications.
8.3 There are no risks identified in respect of this matter in terms of the Corporate and Directorate Risk Registers as the Committee is considering the application as the planning authority in a quasi-judicial role and must determine the application on its own merits in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations justify a departure.

9. **Sustainability Implications**

9.1 No separate consideration of the current proposal’s degree of sustainability is required as the concept is implicit to and wholly integral with the planning process against the policies of which it has been measured.

10. **Departures, Notifications and Referrals**

10.1 **Strategic Development Plan Departures**

None.

10.2 **Local Development Plan Departures**

Policy HE2: Protecting Historic and Cultural Areas

10.3 The application is a departure from the valid Local Development Plan and has been advertised as such. Any representations received have been circulated as part of the agenda and taken into account in recommending a decision. The period for receiving representations has expired.

10.4 The application does not fall within any of the categories contained in the Schedule of the Town and Country Planning (Notification of Applications) (Scotland) Direction 2009 and the application is not required to be notified to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

10.5 The application would not have to be referred to Infrastructure Services Committee in the event of the Area Committee wishing to grant permission for the application.

11. **Recommendation**

11.1 **REFUSE for the following reasons:-**

1. The proposal fails to comply with Policy HE2: Protecting Historic and Cultural Areas, as contained in the Aberdeenshire Local Development Plan 2017, in that the proposed development would neither preserve nor enhance the character and appearance of the Inverallochy Conservation Area, and would undermine the principles of the original designation.

Stephen Archer
Director of Infrastructure Services
Author of Report: Timothy Xu
Report Date: 20 June 2018
APPENDIX 1

Location Plan
APPENDIX 2
Site Plan
APPENDIX 4

Proposed Elevations

East Elevation

South Elevation

West Elevation